



IVO WELCH

Editor

Critical Finance Review

J Fred Weston Professor
UCLA Anderson School
of Management

110 Westwood Plaza, C519
Los Angeles, CA, 90095-1481

ivo.welch@gmail.com

<http://www.ivo-welch.info>

<http://www.critical-finance-review.org>

May 7, 2012

To Whom It May Concern

The CFR requires authors to share the information necessary for other researchers to replicate the results of their papers. This can be done in a variety of ways:

[1] The paper itself must contain descriptions that are sufficient to allow other researchers to replicate results in tables and figures.

[2] Researchers must include the first few observations (“snippets”) that entered into the results (e.g., statistics, regressions). Even proprietary data vendors, such as CRSP and Compustat, allow this—it is fair use under US copyright law.

[3] Authors are strongly encouraged but not required to provide the computer programs that created the data for tables and figures. (Authors are encourage to use snippet or dummy data to illustrate program functioning.) The goal of making the original programs available to CFR readers is to unburden authors from providing support for their papers, not the opposite. Thus, the CFR policy is to request that authors do not respond to reader inquiries that request support. Instead, authors should refer readers to the CFR. In the long run, it is the plan of the CFR to offer centralized fee-based support for the programs.

[4] The ideal situation is for authors to make the data itself available, too. This is not always possible, e.g., when the data is sold by a commercial vendor.

Snippets, programs, and data should be bundled for posting at the CFR upon acceptance of the paper, and will be posted upon publication of the paper. In special cases, the CFR may allow a 2-year moratorium before posting the data to allow authors to exploit data that required years to collect. However, it is discouraged. Experience tells us that fear of third-party abuse (writing competing papers with copied data) is usually unfounded. If anything, making data available sooner rather than later only increases the impact of the original work itself.

It is the policy of the CFR not to publish papers that cannot be replicated anywhere else in the world. This is not for fear of deception by authors, but for fear that inadvertent errors can never be corrected. It is the CFR view that science, unlike faith, requires replicability.

For even bigger exceptions (i.e., without data availability), contact the editor. Be prepared that exceptions will be rare.